

Prof. Scott B. Noegel  
Chair, Dept. of Near Eastern Languages and Civilization  
University of Washington

**Book review:**

**Arbell, Benjamin, ed. *Intercultural Contacts in the Medieval Mediterranean*.  
London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass, 1996.**

**First Published in:**

*Digest of Middle Eastern Studies* 7/1 (1998), 77-87.



correctly called, without merely submitting to fashion, a notion of intertextuality that allowed any part of the revelation (Qur'an-cum-Sunna) to particularize or otherwise explicate any other part. Later jurists seek to *discover* particularizations and explications latent in the revelation itself. They are not simply following the Prophet's lead, doing what he did on their own.

Interpretive reasoning is, to me, *ijtihad*, *istidlal*: it is the extrapolation of law from the authoritative sources (*dalil*, *hujja*). The Prophet's word was itself *dalil*, not *istidlal*. In that respect, the Prophet's position is unique and cannot be occupied by others. It is significant, I think, that some classical jurists debated whether it is possible for the Prophet (S) to engage in *ijtihad*, an activity which would give rise to mere fallible opinion, not to Sunna. The point to be noted is that prophetic opinion (as opposed to Sunna) would lie outside the sphere of *wahy* and would carry no special authority for other Muslims. *Ijtihad* of the Prophet (S) would amount to an extra prophetic activity of the man Muhammad.

Classical thought does, it is true, posit a kind of hierarchy of Qur'an over Sunna. Only the Qur'an is the very speech of God delivered verbatim; only it is miracle, attesting its own authority, whereas the authority of the Sunna must be attested through the Qur'an. And at least one jurist, Shatibi, gave the Qur'an's contents a primacy not enjoyed by the Sunna, as Wael Hallaq's definitive study has shown. But a hierarchy of Qur'an as revelation and Sunna as interpretation is not, to my knowledge, found in the classical tradition.

Wheeler does provide a useful discussion of how authority worked within the Hanafi school. Chapters 3 and 4 are, to my mind, the most valuable chapters of the book. They utilize the distinction between inductive elaboration of principles and deductive application to circumstances to provide an incisive account of how each school of law developed and maintained its internal structure of authority. The extension of the concept of canon to the corpora of authoritative opinions of a school seems to me entirely valid. Furthermore, Wheeler has studied a wide array of Hanafi authors. In fact, as one reads the book, one finds that he proceeds from author to author, devoting a discrete section of the book to each author. The book is thus a kind of series of essays on Ibn Qutaybah, Ibn Abi Hatim, Tabari, Tahawi, Jassas, Quduri, Dabusi, Sarakhsi, Marghinani, and others, all of which are linked to each other within a framework of interesting, if not always (in my view) convincingly argued, ideas.



## I *ntercultural Contacts in the Medieval Mediterranean*

Benjamin Arbell, Editor

London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass, 1996.  
340 pages. \$45 hardback (ISBN 0-7146-4714-4),  
\$22.50 paperback (ISBN 0-7146-4260-6).

Review by

Scott B. Noegel, Ph.D.  
University of Washington

Arbell's collection of twenty-three essays in honor of David Jacoby adds important insights to our understanding of the sophisticated interactions between various Mediterranean peoples in the Middle Ages. The wide variety of topics and high quality of scholarship contained in the volume make it an important contribution to the history of the medieval Mediterranean.

The volume opens with David Abulafia's detailed investigation into the events that led to the clash between Anjou and Aragon in 1316, "The Aragonese Kingdom of Albania: An Angevin Project of 1311-1316." Abulafia explores the correspondence between the Mediterranean powers of the period and reveals political motivations and complex realities masked by assertions of power found in the correspondence. Abulafia demonstrates, for example, how Philip of Taranto looked the other way when Robert, King of Naples, offered him Albania and Achaia, in order that he might embroil Frederick of Trinacria in the "thickets of Balkan politics" (p. 9). Yet, Abulafia also shows that Frederick was not in the dark concerning the reality of conflicting Greek, Slavic, Albanian, and Frankish interests in Albania and Achaia and of the difficulty of extending his authority there. This study suggests that the project inaugurated by the Angevin king of



Naples in 1311 to trade the Kingdom of "Trinacria" for the Aragonese possessions of Albania and Achaia, was still fresh in the mind of Robert after 1314, despite some scholarly claims to the contrary.

Gabriella Airaldi's "Roger of Lauria's Expedition to the Peloponnese" examines the chronicles of Jacopo Doria for their description of admiral Roger of Lauria's trek from Sicily to "Romania" and his sacking of Corfu, Monemvasia, and Chios, an event that angered the Byzantine Emperor and the Genoese. Airaldi traces the effect that the admiral had, not only in the region, but upon the Doria's *Chronicle*, who "mentioned certain locations, while neglecting others" (p. 14). Airaldi takes us through the different historical records that mention the raid, including Marino Sanudo's *Istoria del regno di Romania* and the writings of Mutaner, the Catalan Chronicles. She demonstrates how "Lauria's raid . . . is not merely a typical episode in the general deterioration of that time" (p. 15), and not a simple act of plunder, but rather a highly significant political move that "dealt a severe blow to relations between the Byzantine Empire and the crown of Aragon" (p. 23).

The volume then turns to "The Urban Landscapes of Rhodes as Perceived by Fourteenth- and Fifteenth-Century Travellers," by Michel Balard. Balard documents the transformation of pilgrims' perceptions of Rhodes using material as simple as an impersonal travel record to a virtual "tourists' guide" (p. 24). Balard shows how the increasing attention paid to the *Collachium* (a meeting place of the religious community) and the hospital in voyagers' travel notes is linked to the Knights of the hospital who sought to publicize their charitable activity throughout Christendom. With biblical style, the Knights impressed travelers with their palace treasures and holy relics in order to elicit donations. Balard comments: "In their description of Rhodes' urban landscape, our voyagers pass from the most material detail to biblical images with which their culture is imbued . . . Rhodes becomes, in a way, an anticipation of Jerusalem on the road to the East, a first reflection of Paradise that each pilgrim wishes to attain" (p. 34).

Laura Balletto's "Ethnic Groups, Cross-Social and Cross-Cultural Contacts on Fifteenth-Century Cyprus" sifts through a variety of registers, notarial logs, and chronicles to uncover the results of the Republic of Genoa's treaties of 1374 and 1383 which "imposed on the Cypriot sovereign very harsh conditions which had considerable influence on events in the following years" (p. 35). She details, for example the presence of Jews in Famagusta who "played a role both on the political and on the economic levels" (p. 39), and who frequently interacted and sometimes clashed with the Genoese. Balletto also



details the presence of Catalans, whom the Genoese viewed as Cypriote-protected controllers of piracy; Franks, most abundantly among the aristocracy; Greeks; Armenians; and a host of other peoples from the Levant including Byblians, Turks, and Syrians. Throughout, Balletto demonstrates how cultural interaction prompted cultural exchange and the syncretism of customs and languages.

Ron Barkai's "Between East and West: A Jewish Doctor from Spain" traces the burgeoning of Hebrew scientific writings and translations brought about by the impact of the exodus from Muslim Spain under the Almoravids and Almohads. Barkai devotes the majority of his study to a text found in the treatise *Kitab majannat al-ta'un wa-l-waba'* which contains a medical discussion about the bubonic plague. The sixteenth-century text was written by Eliyahu ben Avraham, a Spanish Jew who dedicated it to the Ottoman sultan, Selim I (1512-1520). Barkai unfolds the fascinating story of this "Spanish doctor who studied medical theory within the framework of his Jewish family, gained practical knowledge from working side by side with Christian physicians, and worked as a doctor in Spanish cities until 1492" (p. 53). Barkai outlines the theological underpinnings of Eliyahu's aetiology for the plague (he attributes it to God's punishment of sinners) and demonstrates how in this respect his viewpoint "is closer to that which was prevalent in the Muslim world than to that of the Christian European world" (p. 61). In Barkai's words, Eliyahu's treatise illustrates "the transmission of both theoretical and practical scientific medical knowledge, from the Christian West to the Muslim East, thanks to the offices of an enlightened Jew who was expelled from Spain" (p. 63).

Vassilios Christides' brief contribution, "New Light on the Transmission of Chinese Naval Technology to the Mediterranean World: The Single Rudder," offers new archaeological, literary, and iconographic evidence for the introduction of the single rudder into the Mediterranean from China. Christides thus challenges the view first proposed by L. Basch (*Le musée imaginaire de la marine antique*, Athens, 1987) who, in Christides' words, believes that "the Arabs closed their eyes to the sophisticated Chinese ships that crossed the Indian ocean alongside their own, and waited until the crusades to adopt the invention of the single rudder from the West" (p. 68). Two iconographic reproductions appear at the end of the article.

"Law and Custom in the Latin East: *Les Letres dou Sepulcre*," by Peter W. Edbury, focuses on the "Letters of the Sepulcher" described both by John of Ibelin, Count of Jaffa, and Philip of Novara, which apparently contained the enacted laws (*assises*) of Jerusalem. Edbury



argues that the Letters "never existed and that Philip of Novara's story was a piece of legal fiction concocted in the mid-thirteenth century in response to a particular problem then facing the ruling clique in the Latin kingdom" (p. 73). Edbury suggests several factors at work compelling the fabrication, including an increased reliance on written title and authority over collective memory of custom and practice, French political ascendancy in Latin Syria which stimulated a "challenge to the interpretation of the customary laws as administered in the High Court" (p. 78), and the contrast between homeland customs and those of Latin Syria felt by French members of the High Court of Jerusalem. Since John of Ibelin and Philip of Novara were forced to pretend ignorance of the *assises*, Edbury argues, an appeal naturally ensued to French custom which was rejoined by claiming that the rulers of Jerusalem had promulgated their own statutes. This forced them to contend that "a whole corpus of legislation had indeed existed and moreover that it had been hallowed by being kept within the sacred precincts of the Holy Sepulcher; since 1187, however, it had been lost for ever" (p. 79).

In "Crusader Art in the Twelfth Century: Reflections on Christian Multiculturalism in the Levant," Jaroslav Folda studies crusader art in conjunction with textual evidence to illuminate Christian cultural interaction and cross-cultural perceptions before 1187. Folda points out that pilgrims such as John of Würzburg and Theodorich, his contemporary, detail, distinguish, and relate to a number of Christian sects and their art in the Holy Land. Moreover, as Folda demonstrates "it was not only the Greek Orthodox, but also especially the Syrian Orthodox who were interested in asserting their place in such multicultural circumstances, along with the Latins" (p. 90). Fold concludes:

the interaction of crusader artists and patrons with those of Greek Orthodox and Syrian orthodox origin not only enabled the great projects of rebuilding and redecorating the holy places to go forward, but these multicultural projects also fostered interest in a cross-cultural presence and the perception of various participants that is unambiguously expressed in certain works of Crusader art, especially in the column paintings and mosaics of the Church of the nativity in Bethlehem (p. 91).

Bernard Hamilton's "Eleanor of Castile and the Crusading Movement" shows Eleanor to be a far more complex and fascinating figure



than recalled by later romantic tales of chivalry and bravery that celebrate and exaggerate her heroine attributes. An independent thinker, pious, and conscious of the political ramifications of the crusades, Eleanor was far from being an automaton of her husband Edward, but rather "went on crusade from a sense of personal conviction and at some cost to herself" (p. 103). Along with the combatant male crusaders, she risked diseases, malnutrition, possible shipwreck, and capture. She lost her son before returning home and another son two years later. Nevertheless, she was tireless in her conviction and piety, and during the return trip even

managed to forge "closer links with Castile, by seeking to defend Castilian interests in the Kingdom of Sicily and by acting as an ambassador on her husband's behalf to the court of Alfonso X" (p. 103). Hamilton suggests that since Eleanor could have commuted her vow to take the crusade for a donation to crusading funds but did not, she had other reasons to go on crusade, including the influence of precedents set by women in her husband's family (e.g., Berengaria of Navarre, Eleanor of Aquitaine, and Queen Marguerite of France), and Edward's desire to avoid the temptation of adultery during his time away, a sexual sin that might "jeopardize the success of the expeditions" (p. 96). Hamilton also touches on Eleanor's gift of an illuminated translation of Vegetius' treatise *De re militari* to her husband. Hamilton concludes: "The picture of marriage which emerges from Eleanor's crusading activity is one of a relationship of parity, and it goes far to explain, I think, why the king mourned his wife so deeply when she died" (p. 103).

Georges Jehel explores the relationship between "Jews and Muslims in Medieval Genoa: From the Twelfth to the Fourteenth Century." Jehel utilizes a host of notarial documents to clarify the degree of





contact between these groups and Christians and demonstrates that while a great number of Muslims were enscribed as slaves in Genoa's booming slave market, Genoa also employed a professor of Arabic and was not without its Arabic interpreters. Jehel correlates the rise in male slave labor with Western economic expansion and rise in urban living standards and suggests that the fact that some Jews in Genoa took part in international trade justifies "giving more importance to the consistency of Jewish settlement in Genoa than is generally accepted" (p. 126). Emerging from Jehel's study are the complex social and cultural interactions and exchange, especially between Jews and Christians, in Genoa. Jehel remarks: "Genoese society is an illustration of urban cultural cosmopolitanism resulting from the socio-economic repercussions of Genoa's far-reaching policy in the Mediterranean" (p. 132).

Alexander Kazhdan's "*Pronoia: The History of a Scholarly Discussion*" traces the treatment and translation of the slippery Greek word *pronoia* (typically rendered "providence" but sometimes "a conditional tenure, or estate granted in return for military service") from the 1600s to the present day. He clarifies the major points of discussion as

- 1) whether the *pronoia* was an institution (predominantly) serving the military organization of the empire; 2) whether the *pronoia* was created in the eleventh century as a grant of real estate; 3) whether it was transformed from a conditional grant (*beneficium*) into hereditary (full) ownership (p. 142).

Kazhdan reveals that the term *pronoia* has long been polysemous, covering a wide range of meanings, and that scholars also are partly to blame for attributing non-existent meanings to the term *pronoia*. Kazhdan concludes:

The *pronoia* was a form of Byzantine ownership and it can be understood only in the context of the Byzantine law, although Byzantine legal textbooks ignore *pronoia*. While in Byzantine legal theory the Roman concept of ownership remained unchangeable, the perception of *pronoia* evolved, and whatever the *pronoia* was it was not the Roman *dominium*. As with many other Byzantine phenomena we are facing, with regard to the *pronoia*, and ambivalence, a contradiction between theory and practice (p. 163).

The volume then moves to Benjamin Z. Kedar and Etan Kohl-



berg's study of the life of Theodore of Antioch, a twelfth-century Jacobite philosopher and scholar of medicine, mathematics, astronomy, and languages. The authors demonstrate that while his own patron, Frederick II, welcomed and honored him, he was not without his detractors. The Dominican Etienne de Salagnac reports how, in an effort to save the face of his Order after Theodore had bested them in philosophical argument, Roland of Cremona rushed to the Emperor's camp to defeat Theodore in argument. Kedar and Kohlberg assert that this event "may be taken to exemplify the new self-confidence of Western scholasticism *via-à-vis* oriental learning no longer regarded as superior" (p. 171). Also considered in this article is the reliability of Bar-Hebraeus account of Theodore's life, which the authors also provide in translation and about which they note: "Bar-Hebraeus' identification of Theodore with the anonymous Antiochene philosopher may be adjudged an editorial oversight, but one which does not cast doubt on the reliability of the details given in the entry on Theodore" (p. 173).

Anthony Luttrell's "The Earliest Documents on the Hospitaller *Corso* at Rhodes: 1413 and 1416" explores the development of Hospitaller's piracy, from its origin in hired shipping and later creation of a small navy to the rise in individual Hospitaller pirates "during the period of great financial strain at Rhodes caused by the schism in the papacy after 1378" (p. 182). Luttrell notes: "There was always scope for individual Hospitaller brethren to profit from piratical activities" (p. 181), and he demonstrates that shipping activities were not limited to the Hospital as an Order but at times were taken up by individual Hospital brethren who armed vessels at their own expense. Luttrell examines the possible motives for Hospitaller interest in the *corso* and finds them to be largely material, though the brethren from France and Auvergne "came from a petty rural *noblesse* nourished on an ideology provided by a reading of chivalric romances which may have stimulated them to participate in piratical adventures against the infidel" (p. 184). Luttrell also investigates the evolution of the Rhodian *corso* after 1416 when it was a "form of state-controlled sea brigandage which became vital to the Hospitallers' prestige and image as holy warriors and also to their economy and that of their port" (p. 186).

Chryssa A. Maltezos studies the will of one Abraham Balanzas for information on the history of Jews on Venetian Crete in "From Crete to Jerusalem: The Will of a Cretan Jew." Maltezos finds the Jews of Abraham's time to have been "in continuous communication with the local element of the island" (p. 190) and provides a copy of the will and also a translation. Maltezos concludes that despite the tumultuous



last years of the sixteenth century, Cretan Jews

accepted the influence of the Cretan environment while remaining true to their traditions. The result of the long proximity of the two elements was that the Jews ended up expressing their feelings and thoughts in the local dialect, employing the local Cretan idiom with admirable facility (p. 194).

Reinhold C. Mueller's contribution, "The Jewish Moneylenders of Late Trecento Venice: A Revisitation," focuses on the years of Venetian economic crisis (1382-1397), the only time in the Middle Ages in which Jews were allowed to lend money in Venice. Mueller moves beyond previous studies which have based themselves mostly on laws and notarial acts. Instead, he looks into the

correspondence, business accounts, and criminal records on two unconnected themes, the dissatisfaction of the Jews in 1388-89 and their readiness to abandon Venice, and the intercultural tie between Venice and the Jews of Spain, victims of the 'pogroms' of 1391 (p. 203).

Mueller follows the path of a Venetian Jewish community who traveled to Spain shortly after the pogrom of 1391 in order to rescue Hebrew books from destruction and bring them back to Italy. Mueller's study recognizes the incredible mobility of the Jewish communities and "the potential competition among them, especially in the sector of consumer credit where their services were sometimes in demand, sometimes considered superfluous, but always judged undesirable" (p. 215).

"The Jews of Chios (1049): A Group of *Excusati*," by Nicolas Oikonomides, expands upon previous research on Constantine IX Monomachos' giving of Jewish families to the monastery of Nea Moni of Chios (1049) by examining the Jews of Chios from the broader perspective of contemporary Byzantine tax exemption. Oikonomides examines the tax laws and suggests that the chrysobull of 1062 which forced Jews to rent housing from the monastery in perpetuity

was not aimed at limiting the freedom of the Jews, specifically or in general; it was merely a way to force them to continue paying *Nea Moni* the compensation for the tax exemption that they enjoyed. Here again, all is motivated by fiscal consider-



ations and by a desire to protect the revenues of the monks, in a spirit of 'equity' (pp. 224-225).

Sandra Origone directs our attention to the relations between Byzantium and the West as characterized by marriage alliances during the age of the Palaiologoi. Origone reveals that in the beginning of the fourteenth century when the Angevin threat compelled Byzantine emperors to enlist Western aid, a "tactical attitude prevailed where the question of mixed marriages was concerned, and the custom of requiring spouses to respect their partner's religious creed was consolidated" (p. 230). Origone draws attention to the slackening attitudes toward canonical restrictions on mixed marriages brought upon by the frequency of such marriages in the fourteenth century. Origone then examines the marriages of Irene of Montferrat, Rita-Maria Xene, Anna of Savoy, and Sophia of Montferrat for evidence of Genoese intervention on behalf of Byzantine marriage policy during a period of Genoese overseas expansion. She concludes that the unfavorable portraits of these women, when compared with the figures of Greek women "seemed conduits of strange and disquieting cultural, political and religious values" (p. 240).

Gherardo Ortalli's "Venice and Papal Bans on Trade with the Levant: The Role of the Jurist" uncovers the political motives of the jurist Rizzardo Malombra whose activities led Pope John XXII to order his persecution for being a rebel and heretic to the Catholic Church in 1326. Ortalli shows how the Pope's actions were not theologically motivated, but rather centered on Venice's desire to maintain old channels of Levantine trade threatened by the Church. Ortalli examines the historical context for the Pope's decree and sees it as a formative period in terms of juridical thought and terminology and a period of intense Venetian reflectivity of its own identity. Ortalli also finds Rizzardo Malombra to have been a "scholar in the service of politics. His reflections especially (but not only) on questions of the Levant constituted a direct challenge to the growing interference of the ecclesiastical authorities in the political and economic life of the state" (p. 258).

Geo Pitarino's "Christians and Jews, Pagans and Muslims in the Thought of Christopher Columbus" is a fascinating look at the careful wording in Columbus' journals. Pitarino observes Columbus' word choice, the primacy he gives to the Holy See in Rome, his silence concerning his own views on Jews and Judaism, and his belief that world unity would be achieved through Christianity. In spite of his views of Muslims, Columbus attaches no moral condemnation to the Jews expelled from Catholic territory. "In Columbus there is no trace



of anti-Semitism or even condemnation of the Jewish faith in relation to the Catholic religion" (pp. 261-262). With the peoples of the West Indies, Columbus believed he faced "a total absence of cultural personality (which Columbus essentially identified with an absence of religious faith) in these people beyond the Ocean" (p. 268). He consequently "convinced himself that he had been predestined for the mission of 'Bearer of Christ,' the 'Messenger of the Trinity,' for the new lands which had not known the word of the Bible" (p. 268). Nevertheless, Columbus' journals reflect a subtle transformation in religious outlook, as noted in his missive of 1501: "I say that the Holy Spirit prevails among Christians, Jews, Moors and in all others of all sects, and not only among the learned, but more so among the ignorant people" (p. 271).

"Freedom and Servitude in Cyprus and Rhodes: An Assize Dating from 1396," by Jean Richard, examines an unpublished assize issued by King James I of Lusignan in 1396 which "expresses part of the preoccupation found in Cyprus throughout the fourteenth, fifteenth, and sixteenth centuries: the fear of the diminution of the population of serfs or *parèques*, who were the only ones subject to all the constraints of the seignorial system" (p. 275). The assize focuses on children born to serf women when their fathers were free men and stipulates that female serfs of seignorial domains must obtain permission from the king before marrying a free man or risk having their children reduced to serfdom. The assize extends a 1297 royal *ordonnance* which placed the free man alone at risk. Richard notes that "the king's authorization, according to the examples which we have, resembles an act of granting freedom and allowed the kings to gain financial advantage" (p. 277) and concludes:

The 1396 assize provided that the irregular situation of children born of serf women married to 'francomates' or cases of concubinage between serfs and free women might be subject to denunciation. The lord who thereby recovers 'parèques' should pay 125 besants per person to the one who denounced them. The assize also provided that these situations could be regularized within a period of three months, if the parents concerned appeared before appointed commissioners to submit their declarations (p. 279).

Alan M. Stahl's "The Deathbed Oration of Doge Mocenigo and the Mint of Venice" challenges the authenticity of the famous *arenga*. Stahl argues that



Taken all together, the dramatic circumstances, the detailed statistics, the unprecedented context and the fulfilled prophecies of the Mocenigo *arenga* necessarily calls forth doubts as to whether it is, indeed, the actual text of a speech given by the Doge on this occasion (p. 285).

The document also appears nowhere in any archival document or other contemporary source, and the earliest extant version of the text appears to have been written in the fifteenth century. Stahl reviews previous attempts to reconcile the statistic reported in the *arenga* with chronicled sources and then turns his attention to a comparison of the passage the *arenga* contains on the products of the Venetian mint with information derived from independent documentary and numismatic evidence. Stahl examines the inconsistencies between extant versions of the story with regard to the numbers of coins minted and the problems posed by the terminology and concludes:

The exaggerated and apparently anachronistic mint statistics may have been added to the text of a genuine speech made by Mocenigo on his deathbed or on another occasion. Or they may be an indication that the entire *arenga* was the product of a later date, with some current political issues underlying the prophetic words put in the mouth of the dying Doge (p. 301).

The volume concludes with Maria Francesca Tiepolo's contribution "Public Documents and Notarial Praxis: Some Examples from Venetian Greece of the Early Fourteenth Century." Tiepolo draws our interest to several documents in the Venetian State Archives that date to the period of Venetian rule on Crete and that comprise a small portion of the archives of the duke and the archives of the notaries of Candia. Tiepolo focuses on semi-public documents which link the private notarial and public chancery spheres and examines the formulae these documents contain for evidence of hesitation by the notaries and difficulties that the notaries try to overcome. Tiepolo also provides editions of these documents in appendices.

This is a fine collection of articles by eminent scholars and an excellent tribute to David Jacoby. Filled with interesting insights and numerous appendicized textual editions and translations of pertinent manuscripts, this volume offers readers a wide variety of topical discussions on various aspects of the medieval Mediterranean. Recommended for students and scholars of medieval history.